Patient Safety in Nursing: A Systematic Review

Mahmood Motamedzadeh 1*, Hosein Mahmoudi 2*, Batool Nehrir 1, Abbas Ebadi 3

1 Faculty of Nursing, Baqiyatallah University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran
2 Faculty of Nursing and Trauma Research Center, Baqiyatallah University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran
3 Behavioral Sciences Research Center, Faculty of Nursing, Baqiyatallah University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran

Corresponding Author: Hosein Mahmoudi, Faculty of Nursing and Trauma Research Center, Baqiyatallah University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. E-mail: h.mahmoudi@bmsu.ac.ir

Received April 24, 2017; Accepted May 14, 2017; Online Published June 29, 2017

Abstract
Introduction: Patient safety is a major public health problem. In fact, patient safety is a global health concern that affects patients in all areas of healthcare throughout the world, whether in developed or developing countries, and it is important to have a wide range of nursing practices such as education, clinics, and management. Considering the importance of patient safety in the quality of care and outcomes of patients, this study was conducted to systematically review patient safety in Iran and in the world.

Methods: This article follows the review of texts on patient safety dated between 2008 and 2016 found in Internet searches and library studies with the keywords 'patient safety training', 'quality of care', and 'nursing' using databases such as MEDLINE, CINAHL, and ISI, which index the vast majority of published journals and publications. From the articles searched, 23 were obtained and reviewed. Out of the large amount of quantitative and qualitative studies found, articles about the patient safety in nursing were selected and their results are summarized in Table 1 below.

Results: The results of the review of 23 articles showed that patient safety in the majority of Iranian hospitals was at acceptable levels, and only in a few cities such as Shiraz and Hamadan.

Conclusion: According to the review, further planning is needed to improve the patient's safety, such as reducing mistakes, incidents of falling, hospital infections, surgical complications, and improving other safety features so that all hospitals in the future will be upgraded to safety-friendly hospitals.

Keywords: Patient Safety Education; Quality of Care and Nursing


Introduction

Patient safety is a major public health problem. In fact, patient safety is a global concern in the field of health that affects all areas of healthcare throughout the world, whether in developed or developing countries. It is an important issue in nursing, including the areas of education, clinical education, and management. Based on the available evidence, it is estimated that between 5% and 10% of costs in health systems result from unsafe activities and injuries to patients. In developing countries, one of every ten patients is injured while receiving hospital services. Although there are no accurate statistics about developing countries, the probability is far greater. Uninsured services, in addition to having unpleasant consequences for the patient and his/her family, lead to stress and an economic burden on the health system and society. Patient safety includes such concerns as drug errors, surgical procedures, misdiagnoses, device and equipment failures that result in misdiagnoses, and other cases involving hospital infections, patient falls, bed sores, misconduct, etc. One Harvard study showed that more than 70% of harmful events for patients were caused by the negligence of healthcare workers, and more than 90% of them were preventable. The importance of observing safe nursing practices stems from the pain and suffering that patients and their families suffer from the errors of the treatment team members. The starting point for this suffering is the stress patients feel when paying hospital fees, which increase with prolonged hospitalization. Complications caused not by a patient’s initial illness which led them to the healthcare team, but by the mistakes of members of the healthcare team, such as the physician and the nurse, ultimately impose material and emotional costs upon the patient. Considering the
importance of patient safety in the quality of care and patient outcomes, the current study aimed to systematically review patient safety in Iran and in the world.

Figure 1: Input and output Diagram of primary studies to final synthesis

Table 1. Information on 23 Patient Safety Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study Results</th>
<th>Society studied</th>
<th>Sample size</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Study title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The total average safety score of patients in hospitals was 63. The dimensions of reporting frequency and data transfer interchange were 56 and 55, respectively, with the lowest mean and dimensions of &quot;organizational learning&quot; and &quot;expectations-management measures&quot; each with a mean of 69 and the highest average among the 12 dimensions of safety culture.</td>
<td>Medical personnel</td>
<td>312</td>
<td>Tehran</td>
<td>Study of the status of patient safety culture from the viewpoint of staff of teaching hospitals in Tehran</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Mohebifar et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The two main points of the content analysis were: 1. Creating an educational program on patient safety and turning routine nursing into evidence-based nursing, taking into account patient safety principles. 2. Involving students in patient care by establishing a link between knowledge and practice and also increasing the correlation between health system providers.</td>
<td>nursing students</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>Iran</td>
<td>Reviewing the Viewpoints and Suggestions of Nursing Students in Patient Safety for the Development of a Nursing Program in Iran</td>
<td>201</td>
<td>Weis Moradi et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%9 of people said employees could not freely question the authorities' actions. 23% of our work unit's safety culture has a good score and 52% of the grade. &quot;The scope of team work within units&quot; is one of the strengths of the organization.</td>
<td>Hospital staff</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>Urmia</td>
<td>Study of the status of patient safety culture in staff of educational and therapeutic centers affiliated to Urmia University of Medical Sciences</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Baqaei et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The status of all aspects of the patient safety culture and the two dimensions of the implications of the existence of a safety culture have been low to moderate. The dimensions of &quot;non-punitive reaction to error&quot; and &quot;teamwork between the units of the hospital&quot; had the lowest scores, and &quot;teamwork within the department&quot; had the highest score.</td>
<td>nurses</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>Hamedan</td>
<td>The Study of the Dimensions of Patient Safety Culture from Hamadan Nurses' Viewpoints</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Shahr Abadi et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The status of all aspects of the patient safety culture and the two dimensions of the implications of the existence of a safety culture have been low to moderate. The dimensions of &quot;non-punitive reaction to error&quot; and &quot;teamwork between the units of the hospital&quot; had the lowest scores, and &quot;teamwork within the department&quot; had the highest score.</td>
<td>Hospital staff</td>
<td>313</td>
<td>Tehran</td>
<td>Employee perception of patient safety culture in selected hospitals of Tehran University of Medical Sciences</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Abdi et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The level of patient safety culture was moderate in different hospitals, and there was no significant difference between hospitals. The strongest dimension of the safety culture, the &quot;work team&quot;, achieved 74% positive response. The organizational posts of people also had a significant difference in the overall score of safety culture.</td>
<td>All health personnel</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>Tehran</td>
<td>Study of the status of patient safety culture in teaching hospitals affiliated to Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences in 2011</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Mahfouzpour et al.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Methods
This article follows the review of texts on patient safety dated between 2008 and 2016 found in Internet searches and library studies with the keywords "patient safety training", "quality of care", and "nursing" using databases such as MEDLINE, CINAHL, and ISI, which index the vast majority of published journals and publications (Figure 1). Out of the large amount of quantitative and qualitative studies found, articles about patient safety in nursing were selected, and their results are summarized in Table 1 below.

Results
A systematic review of patient safety is summarized in Table 1 (8-30).
The strengths of the patient safety culture in university hospitals are three dimensions: "Organizational learning - Continuous improvement", "Teamwork within hospital units", "Non-punitive response in case of mistakes"; and in private hospitals are two dimensions: "Organizational learning - Continuous improvement" "And" non-punitive response in the event of an error. The lowest safety rating in academic hospitals was "Communication and providing feedback on errors," and in private hospitals related to the "transfer of patients to the hospital and the exchange of patient information between units." Most nurses did not report any incidents that occurred during the past year.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study Results</th>
<th>Society studied</th>
<th>Sample size</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Study title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The safety rating of the patient was inferior in almost all dimensions to the base hospitals. The two dimensions of &quot;team work within units&quot; and &quot;non-punitive response in case of error&quot; were identified as the highest and lowest number of the patient safety culture dimensions.</td>
<td>Medical staff</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>Tehran</td>
<td>Assessing the status of patient safety culture in public hospitals affiliated to Tehran University of Medical Sciences</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>Maghari et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The highest score for the diagnostic sections and paraclinic groups was in the field of &quot;teamwork within the organizational units&quot; (83%) and the lowest score for the paraclinic group was in the &quot;non-punitive response to the event of errors&quot; (42%). The highest score was part of the special department in the area of &quot;employee issues&quot; (42%).</td>
<td>Medical staff</td>
<td>332</td>
<td>Tehran</td>
<td>Surveying the Learning Centers of Patient Safety Culture at the Educational Center, Shahid Rajaee Cardiology Research Center in 2013</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Momeni et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About 15% of patients described the status of the safety culture at a very good level. Among the dimensions of the patient safety culture, the two dimensions of &quot;continuous organizational upgrade&quot; and &quot;teamwork&quot; in the sectors were able to score over 50%.</td>
<td>Hospital staff</td>
<td>367</td>
<td>Jahrom</td>
<td>Study of the status of patient safety culture from nurses' point of view in educational hospitals of Shiraz and providing solutions for improving the status.</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Zendegani et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The patient safety culture is undesirable in all educational hospitals of Shiraz University of Medical Sciences. &quot;Organizational training in patient safety&quot; was the most inadequate dimension, and &quot;how to transfer a patient between sectors&quot; was the most appropriate.</td>
<td>Nurses</td>
<td>412</td>
<td>Shiraz</td>
<td>Investigating patient safety culture from nurses' point of view in educational hospitals of Shiraz and providing solutions for improving the status.</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>Hatam et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The dimensions of &quot;team work within the sectors&quot; and &quot;overall perception of safety&quot; had the highest scores, and the &quot;non-punitive response to error&quot; had the lowest score among the 12 dimensions of patient safety culture.</td>
<td>Medical staff and patients</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>Tehran</td>
<td>Relationship of patient safety culture with patient perception of service quality in selected military hospitals in 2013</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Zaboli et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Management support for patient safety&quot; received the highest score, and &quot;non-punitive response in case of error&quot; had the lowest score. People over the age of 35 had a better overall understanding of patient safety.</td>
<td>Hospital staff</td>
<td>439</td>
<td>Kerman</td>
<td>Familiarity of Kerman Hospital staff with respect to patient safety culture</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Saber et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Teamwork between hospital units&quot; and &quot;management expectations and management&quot; had the highest scores, and &quot;non-punitive response to error&quot; and &quot;manager support&quot; had the lowest scores. The overall safety culture score was 61.81%.</td>
<td>Hospital staff</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>Yasuj</td>
<td>Status of patient safety culture from the viewpoint of hospital staff in Yasuj city in 2014</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Rezaian et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The condition of the patient safety culture was moderate, and only about 23% of workers report the status of the patient safety culture as being very good.</td>
<td>Hospital staff</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>Jiroft</td>
<td>Study of the status of patient safety culture in hospitals in Jiroft city in 2014</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Faryabi et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The two dimensions of &quot;communication and providing feedback on errors&quot; and &quot;organizational learning and continuous improvement&quot; received the highest scores, and the two dimensions of &quot;non-punitive response in case of errors&quot; and &quot;openness of communication</td>
<td>Medical personnel</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>Tehran</td>
<td>Study of the status of patient safety culture at Razi Psychiatric Center, Tehran</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>Ajali et al.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Study Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Society studied</th>
<th>Sample size</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Study title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Owners of the Patient Safety Related Process</td>
<td>322</td>
<td>Amol</td>
<td>The relationship between patient safety culture and nursing professional behavior within the framework of the implementation of clinical governance</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Jabari et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owners of the Patient Safety Related Process</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>Medical personnel</td>
<td>Assessing patient safety culture at Fatemeh Al Zahra Hospital in Najafabad</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Izadi et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owners of the Patient Safety Related Process</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Hospital staff</td>
<td>Patient safety culture from the point of view of health care clinics</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Salarvand et al.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owners of the Patient Safety Related Process</td>
<td>456</td>
<td>Mazandaran</td>
<td>Patient safety culture from the viewpoint of nurses working in hospitals in Mazandaran province</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>Sharifi et al.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Discussion

The systematic review of safety culture surveys in different hospitals in Iran showed that in most hospitals in Iran, patient safety is at an acceptable level, seven studies in the field of safety in Tehran conducted by Mohibi Far and Ashkaran (1391), Abdi et al. (2011), Mahfouzpour et al. (2011), Moghadar et al. (1388), Momeni et al. (1392), Zabali (1392), and Aley et al. (1393) showed that patient safety in hospitals in Tehran was moderate and acceptable. In two studies in Ahwaz which assessed patient safety indexes with the highest score and continuous education, they earned the lowest score. In a study of safety culture, both in educational hospitals and in private hospitals, "organizational learning" and "non-professorial response to error"
earned the highest score, while the lowest score in educational hospitals was in communications, and in private hospitals was related to the transfer of patients. This result may be due to the over-crowding in educational hospitals and my health problems in private hospitals are due to the lack of equipment and facilities for the transfer of patients. Two studies in Isfahan showed that the overall viewpoint on patient health and patient safety was acceptable. The study of Shahr Abadi et al. in Hamedan in 2012, however, showed that patient immunity is weak. A study in Urmia also showed that although the patient rating was acceptable, the hospital’s atmosphere was not suitable for learning, and the majority of the staff could not comment on the actions of the authorities. In contrast, studies in the northern Iranian cities of Amol, Rasht, and Mazandaran showed that the atmosphere in Amol and Mazandaran had a beneficial effect on teamwork and learning, while the study in Rasht showed that the behavior of the profession the safety of the patient is modest. The study of Faryabi et al. in Jiroft in 2014 indicated that the patient safety culture there is moderate, while patient safety in Shiraz was reported to be undesirable. Studies in other cities of Iran such as Kermanshah, Gonabad, Yasuj, and Khoramabad among others showed that patient safety was acceptable.

Conclusion
Although studies in various hospitals in Iranian cities showed that patient safety was moderate or good in the majority of hospitals, there remains a need for more planning to improve patient safety in areas such as reducing mistakes, patient falls, hospital infections, surgical complications, and other safety issues in the future so that all hospitals are promoted to hospitals that are safe for the patients.

Ethical Approval
The current study was approved by the Ethics Committee of a local hospital.

Authors’ Contributions
All authors contributed equally to this study.

Conflict of Interest Disclosures
The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest.

Funding
This study received a grant from the Clinical Research Development Unit of Baqiyatallah hospital.

Acknowledgments
The Authors would like to thank from the “Clinical Research Development Unit” of Baqiyatallah Hospital for their kindly cooperation.

References
17. Zendegani N, Zarezadeh N, Montasari M, Rabiei S. [Evaluating patient’s safety from the perspective of health-care officials in hospitals affiliated with jahrom University of...